

THE INTERNATIONAL LAW OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND STATES OF EXCEPTION

WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO
THE *TRAVAUX PREPARATOIRES* AND
CASE-LAW OF THE
INTERNATIONAL MONITORING ORGANS

by

ANNA-LENA SVENSSON-McCARTHY



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
THE HAGUE / BOSTON / LONDON

A C.I.P. Catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 90-411-1021-6

Published by Kluwer Law International,
P.O. Box 85889, 2508 CN The Hague, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America
by Kluwer Law International,
675 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA 02139, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Law International, Distribution Centre,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1998 Kluwer Law International
Kluwer Law International incorporates the publishing programmes of
Graham & Trotman Ltd, Kluwer Law and Taxation Publishers,
and Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

☪ TABLE OF CONTENTS ☪

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS...xix

ABBREVIATIONS...xxii

TERMINOLOGY...xxiv

GENERAL INTRODUCTION...1

PART I – EMERGENCY POWERS IN A HISTORIC PERSPECTIVE

CHAPTER 1 – PUBLIC EMERGENCIES YESTERDAY AND TODAY...9

1. The *aesymnetés* or elected tyrants...9
2. The Roman dictatorship...11
3. Martial law in England...19
4. Martial law and the suspension of *habeas corpus* in the United States...23
5. Martial law and the suspension of *habeas corpus* in the Philippines...32
6. State of siege in France...36
- Conclusions...42

PART II – A BASIC LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR CONSIDERING LIMITATIONS ON HUMAN RIGHTS

INTRODUCTION...49

CHAPTER 2 – THE PRINCIPLE OF LEGALITY...52

1. The principle of legality at the universal level...54
 - A. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights...54
 - a. The preparatory works...54

- B. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...59
 - a. The preparatory works...60
 - b. The work of the Human Rights Committee...63
- 2. The principle of legality at the regional level...66
 - A. The American Convention on Human Rights...66
 - a. The preparatory works...66
 - b. The advisory opinions of the Inter-American Court on Human Rights...67
 - B. The European Convention on Human Rights...73
 - a. The preparatory works...73
 - b. The case-law of the European Court and Commission of Human Rights...75
 - i. Basis in domestic law...75
 - ii. Accessibility...79
 - iii. Foreseeability...81
 - iv. Safeguards against abuse...83
- Conclusions...93

CHAPTER 3 – THE PRINCIPLE OF A DEMOCRATIC SOCIETY...95

- 1. The principle of a democratic society at the universal level...96
 - A. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights...96
 - a. The preparatory works...96
 - B. The International Covenants on Human Rights...102
 - a. The preparatory works...102
 - i. The right to peaceful assembly in Art. 21 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...103
 - ii. The right to freedom of association in Art. 22 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...104
 - iii. The right to a public trial in Art. 14(1) of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...105
 - iv. The right to freedom of expression and information in Art. 19 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...106
 - v. The right to privacy, family, home and correspondence in Art. 17 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...107
 - vi. Art. 4 of the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights...108
 - b. The work of the Human Rights Committee...109
- 2. The principle of a democratic society at the regional level...114

A. The American Convention on Human Rights...	115
a. The institutional framework...	115
b. Opinions of the Inter-American Commission and Court on Human Rights...	116
B. The European Convention on Human Rights...	120
a. The institutional and conventional framework...	120
b. The preparatory works...	122
c. The case-law of the European Court and Commission of Human Rights...	126
i. Freedom of expression in Art. 10...	126
ii. The right to respect for one's private and family life in Art. 8...	134
iii. The right to freedom of association and of assembly in Art. 11...	135
iv. The right to free elections in Art. 3 of Protocol No. 1...	138
v. The right of derogation for the States Parties in Art. 15(1)...	141
Conclusions...	145

CHAPTER 4 – THE NOTIONS OF NATIONAL SECURITY AND PUBLIC ORDER...147

1. The notions of national security and public order at the universal level...	149
A. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights...	149
a. The preparatory works...	149
B. The International Covenants on Human Rights...	152
a. The preparatory works...	152
i. The right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion in Art. 18 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...	152
ii. The right to freedom of expression and information in Art. 19 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...	153
iii. The right to peaceful assembly in Art. 21 of the Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...	156
iv. Art. 4 of the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights...	159
b. The Human Rights Committee...	161
2. The notions of national security and public order at the regional level...	166

A. The American Convention on Human Rights...	166
a. The Inter-American Court of Human Rights...	167
B. The European Convention on Human Rights...	172
a. The European Court and Commission of Human Rights...	172
i. Secret surveillance...	172
ii. Discipline within the armed forces and the civil service...	178
iii. Miscellaneous cases...	182
Conclusions...	188

CONCLUSIONS TO PART II...190

PART III – THE NOTION OF PUBLIC EMERGENCY IN THE INTERNATIONAL LAW OF HUMAN RIGHTS

INTRODUCTION...195

CHAPTER 5 – THE NOTION OF PUBLIC EMERGENCY AT THE UNIVERSAL LEVEL...199

1. The origin, evolution and final acceptance of the public emergency concept: the preparatory works...	200
A. Phase I: The Commission on Human Rights 1947-1948...	200
B. Phase II: The Commission on Human Rights 1949-1952...	203
C. Phase III: The General Assembly 1963...	212
2. The work of the Human Rights Committee...	217
A. The contents of the periodic state reports...	217
B. The consideration of state reports...	219
a. Existence, origin and justification of states of emergency...	219
b. The temporal element...	226
c. The control of emergency measures...	228
d. Reservations...	231
C. The Optional Protocol...	234
Conclusions...	239

CHAPTER 6 – THE NOTION OF PUBLIC EMERGENCY IN THE AMERICAS...242

1. States of siege - an early concern...	244
2. The American Convention on Human Rights - Art. 27...	247

- A. A brief history...247
- B. The emergency provisions in the three draft conventions...248
- C. The Inter-American Conference on Human Rights, 1969...250
- 3. The work of the Inter-American Court and Commission on Human Rights...253
 - A. The Court...253
 - B. The Commission...254
 - a. Application of regional conventional law...255
 - b. Application of the most accepted doctrine...268
 - c. The doctrine on the limits of state repression...274
 - d. Application of universal conventional law...277
- Conclusions...281

CHAPTER 7 – THE NOTION OF PUBLIC EMERGENCY IN EUROPE...285

- 1. The preparatory works...286
- 2. The case-law of the European Court and Commission of Human Rights...290
 - A. The definition of the emergency notion in Art. 15(1)...291
 - a. The *Lawless* case...291
 - b. The *Greek* case...300
 - c. The *Irish* case...307
 - d. The case of Brannigan and McBride...309
 - B. Power of review and grant of discretion...313
 - C. *Proprio motu* application of Art. 15...319
 - D. Reservations and interpretative declarations under Art. 15...322
- Conclusions...324

CHAPTER 8 – THE INTERNATIONAL LABOUR CONVENTIONS AND THE NOTION OF PUBLIC EMERGENCY...326

- 1. The International Labour Code...327
- 2. The Forced Labour Conventions...329
 - A. The 1930 Convention (No. 29) – the preparatory works...329
 - a. The interpretation of Art. 2(2)(d) by the ILO organs...333
 - i. The general interpretative approach...333
 - ii. Public emergencies and economic problems...335
 - B. The 1957 Convention (No. 105)...338
- 3. Freedom of association and collective bargaining...342
 - A. The Commissions of Inquiry (Art. 26 of the ILO Constitution)...342

- a. The case of Greece...342
- b. The case of Poland...346
- B. The Governing Body Committee on Freedom of Association...351
- C. The Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations...360
- Conclusions...365

CONCLUSIONS TO PART III...367

PART IV – THE NON-DEROGABLE OBLIGATIONS IN THE INTERNATIONAL LAW OF HUMAN RIGHTS

INTRODUCTION...371

- 1. Practical, theoretical and semantical problems linked to non-derogable rights...372.
- 2. Human rights and international humanitarian law: their common concerns and respective specificity...375

CHAPTER 9 – THE NON-DEROGABLE OBLIGATIONS UNDER THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS...380

- 1. The preparatory works...380
 - A. The Commission on Human Rights 1948-1954...380
 - B. The General Assembly 1963...389
- 2. The work of the Human Rights Committee...392
 - A. General questions relating to Art. 4(2)...392
 - B. Questions relating to specific articles protected by Art. 4(2)...394
 - a. The right to life – Art. 6...394
 - i. General lack of an effective legal protection of the right to life...395
 - ii. The death penalty...401
 - iii. Living standards, health care and environmental pollution...406
 - b. The right to freedom from torture, cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment and punishment – Art. 7...408
 - i. The duty to provide general protection against ill-treatment...408
 - ii. The duty to provide special protection against ill-treatment...412

- iii. The duty to provide effective guarantees and remedies...414
- iv. The scope of individual responsibility...415
- v. The meaning of treatment contrary to Art. 7 and its relationship to Art. 10(1)...415
- vi. Prison treatment in general...418
- vii. Solitary confinement...419
- viii. Detention on death row...427
- ix. Corporal punishment...428
- x. Medical and scientific experimentation...429
- c. The right to freedom from slavery and servitude - Art. 8(1) and (2)...429
- d. Prohibition on imprisonment for inability to fulfil a contractual obligation - Art. 11...430
- e. Non-retroactivity of criminal law - Art. 15...431
- f. The right to recognition as a legal person - Art. 16...433
- g. The right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion - Art. 18...433
 - i. General understanding of the three freedoms...434
 - ii. The freedom to choose and change religion...434
 - iii. The freedom to manifest one's beliefs...435
 - iv. Limitations on the freedom to manifest one's beliefs...437
 - v. Non-discrimination between religions and churches...439
 - vi. Religious and philosophical education...441
 - vii. Conscientious objection to military service...442
- C. The widening field of non-derogability...445
 - a. Arts. 2, 9 and 14...445
 - b. Art. 10(1)...447
- Conclusions...448

CHAPTER 10 – THE NON-DEROGABLE OBLIGATIONS UNDER THE AMERICAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS...451

- 1. The preparatory works...451
- 2. Opinions of the Inter-American Court and Commission on Human Rights...453
 - A. The obligation to respect and ensure human rights - Art. 1(1)...453
 - B. The right to juridical guarantees - Art. 27(2) *in fine*...455
 - C. The right to juridical personality - Art. 3...463
 - D. The right to life - Art. 4...463
 - a. Enforced or involuntary disappearances and extra-judicial executions...464

- i. The *Velásquez* case...464
 - ii. The *Garbi and Corrales* case...467
 - iii. The *Gangaram Panday* case...468
 - iv. The case of *Neira Alegría et al.*...470
 - v. Views of the Commission...471
- b. The death penalty...475
 - i. Restrictions on the application of death penalty...475
 - ii. Death penalty and due process of law...478
- E. The right to humane treatment - Art. 5...480
- F. The right to freedom from slavery - Art. 6...481
- G. Freedom from *ex post facto* laws - Art. 9...482
- H. The right to freedom of conscience and religion - Art. 12...482
- I. Rights of the family - Art. 17...483
- J. Right to a name - Art. 18...484
- K. Rights of the child - Art. 19...484
- L. Right to a nationality - Art. 20...485
- M. The right to participate in government - Art. 23...486
 - a. Authenticity of elections...487
 - b. The periodicity and secrecy of elections...488
 - c. The universality of suffrage...489
 - d. Individual cases...489
- N. Friendly settlements...492
- Conclusions...495

CHAPTER 11 – THE NON-DEROGABLE OBLIGATIONS UNDER THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS...497

- 1. The preparatory works...498
- 2. The case-law of the European Commission and Court of Human Rights...499
 - A. The right to life - Art. 2 of the Convention and Art. 1 of Protocol No. 6...499
 - a. The general protection of the right to life - Art. 2(1)...501
 - b. The right of the unborn child - Art. 2(1)...505
 - c. The death penalty - Art. 2(1) of the Convention and Art. 1 of Protocol No. 6...505
 - d. Deprivations of life for a lawful purpose - Art. 2(2)...506
 - e. Deaths resulting from lawful acts of war - Art. 15(2)...515
 - B. The right to freedom from torture, inhuman, degrading treatment or punishment - Art. 3...516
 - a. General interpretative approach...516
 - b. Torture, inhuman and degrading treatment...517

c. Inhuman and degrading punishment...	523
d. Expulsion and extradition...	528
e. Solitary confinement...	535
f. Conditions of detention and imprisonment in general...	538
g. Detention of persons of ill health...	542
h. Medical and psychiatric examination...	545
i. Medical experimentation without consent...	545
j. Environmental problems...	546
C. The right to freedom from slavery and servitude - Art. 4(1)...	546
D. Freedom from <i>ex post facto</i> laws and the principle <i>ne bis in idem</i> - Art. 7 of the Convention, Art. 4 of Protocol No. 7...	547
a. Retroactivity and unreasonable uncertainty of legal provisions...	548
b. Preventive measures...	551
c. The definition of offences...	554
d. Proceedings falling outside the framework of Art. 7(1)...	554
e. The principle <i>ne bis in idem</i> - Art. 4 of Protocol No. 7...	555
E. Friendly settlements...	556
Conclusions...	559

CONCLUSIONS TO PART IV...562

PART V – REMAINING CONDITIONS FOR THE LAWFUL DEROGATION FROM THE INTERNATIONAL LAW OF HUMAN RIGHTS

INTRODUCTION...567

CHAPTER 12 – THE CONDITION OF STRICT NECESSITY...568

1. Art. 4(1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...	569
A. The condition of strict necessity in general...	569
a. The preparatory works...	569
b. The work of the Human Rights Committee...	570
i. Views adopted under the Optional Protocol...	570
ii. Questions relating to the condition of strict necessity...	571
B. The condition of strict necessity and the right to liberty and security of person (Arts. 4(1) and 9)...	574
C. The condition of strict necessity and the right to due process of law (Arts. 4(1) and 14)...	576
2. Art. 27(1) of the American Convention on Human Rights...	581
A. The condition of strict necessity in general...	581

- B. The condition of strict necessity and the right to liberty and security of person (Arts. 27(1) and 7)...585
- C. The condition of strict necessity and the right to due process of law (Arts. 27(1) and 8 of the Convention)...587
- 3. Art. 15(1) of the European Convention on Human Rights...590
 - A. The condition of strict necessity in general...590
 - B. The condition of strict necessity and the right to liberty and security of person (Arts. 15(1) and 5)...592
 - C. The condition of strict necessity and the right to due process of law (Arts. 15(1) and 6)...612
- Conclusions...621

CHAPTER 13 – THE CONDITION OF CONSISTENCY WITH OTHER INTERNATIONAL LEGAL OBLIGATIONS...624

- 1. Art. 4(1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...624
- 2. The case-law of the international control organs...627
 - A. The Human Rights Committee...627
 - B. The Inter-American Commission on Human Rights...628
 - C. The European Commission and Court of Human Rights...630
- 3. General discussion on the meaning of the terms “other obligations under international law”...632
 - A. The United Nations Charter...633
 - B. Other human rights treaties...635
 - C. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights...636
 - D. International humanitarian law...637
- Conclusions...638

CHAPTER 14 – THE PROHIBITION OF DISCRIMINATION...640

- 1. Art. 4(1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...642
 - A. The preparatory works...643
 - B. The work of the Human Rights Committee...646
 - a. The principle of non-discrimination in general...646
 - b. The principle of non-discrimination in public emergencies...649
- 2. Art. 27(1) of the American Convention on Human Rights...650
 - A. The case-law of the Inter-American Court and Commission on Human Rights...651
 - a. The principle of non-discrimination in general...651

- b. The principle of non-discrimination in public emergencies...656
- 3. Art. 15 of the European Convention on Human Rights...658
 - A. The case-law of the European Court and Commission of Human Rights...660
 - a. The principle of non-discrimination in general...660
 - b. The principle of non-discrimination in public emergencies...662
- 4. Discrimination on grounds of national or ethnic origin during Second World War...669
 - A. England...671
 - B. France...673
 - C. The United States...675
- Conclusions...681

CHAPTER 15 – THE CONDITION OF INTERNATIONAL NOTIFICATION...683

- 1. Art. 4(3) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights...685
 - A. The preparatory works...685
 - B. The work of the Human Rights Committee...689
 - a. The obligation in general to submit notices of derogation...689
 - b. The timing of derogation notices...693
 - c. The contents of derogation notices...693
 - d. Notices of termination of derogations...694
 - e. Sanctions for non-fulfillment of the notification requirement...695
- 2. Art. 27(3) of the American Convention on Human Rights...696
 - A. The work of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights...696
 - a. The obligation in general to submit notices of suspension...696
 - b. The nature of the notification requirement and sanctions for non-fulfillment...697
 - c. Miscellaneous statements on the notification requirement...698
- 3. Art. 15(3) of the European Convention on Human Rights...700
 - A. The preparatory works...700
 - B. The obligation in general to submit notices of derogation...700
 - C. The derogation notices in practice...701
 - D. The case-law of the European Commission and Court of Human Rights...704
 - a. The role of the Convention organs in view of the *ratio legis*...704
 - b. The form of derogation notices...704

c. The timing of derogation notices...	705
d. The contents of derogation notices...	708
e. The nature of the notification requirement and sanctions for non-fulfillment...	712
f. Notices of termination of derogations...	716
Conclusions...	716
CONCLUSIONS TO PART V...	719
GENERAL CONCLUSIONS...	721
BIBLIOGRAPHY...	729
INDEX...	767