REGIONAL PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS

Dinah L. Shelton

Paolo G. Carozza
CONTENTS

Foreword xxiii
Acknowledgments xxv
Abbreviations xxvii
Bibliographical Note on Print and Internet Resources xxix

CHAPTER I. REGIONAL ORGANIZATIONS AND HUMAN RIGHTS 1

1.1 THE EVOLUTION OF INTERNATIONAL CONCERN WITH HUMAN RIGHTS 1
   Louis B. Sohn, The New International Law: Protection of the Rights of Individuals Rather than States 1
   Dinah L. Shelton, The Promise of Regional Human Rights Systems 11
   Questions and Comments 12

1.2 EUROPEAN REGIONAL ORGANIZATIONS 13
   1.2.1 The Council of Europe 13
       Statute of the Council of Europe (extracts) 13
       Human Rights Standard-Setting by the Council of Europe 14
       Applicants for Membership: The Case of Belarus 19
       Eur. Parl. Assembly, Situation in Belarus 20
       Eur. Parl. Assembly Debate, Situation in Belarus 22
       Questions and Comments 24
## CONTENTS

### 1-3

- Constitution of South Africa
- Constitution of the United Mexican States

### 2.2 Commentary and Jurisprudence

- Janet Koven Levit, The Constitutionalization of Human Rights in Argentina: Problem or Promise?
- Good v. Republic of Botswana

#### SELF-EXECUTING AND NON-SELF-EXECUTING TREATIES

- Thomas Buergenthal, Self-Executing and Non-Executing Treaties in National and International Law
- International Responsibility for the Promulgation and Enforcement of Laws in Violation of the Convention (Arts. 1 and 2 of the American Convention on Human Rights)
- Legal Resources Foundation v. Zambia
- Civil Liberties Organization v. Nigeria

#### RESERVATIONS TO HUMAN RIGHTS TREATIES

#### THE OBLIGATIONS OF FEDERAL STATES

- Thomas Buergenthal, The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights
- Johanna Kalb, Dynamic Federalism in Human Rights Treaty Implementation

### CHAPTER III. THE REGIONAL INSTITUTIONS AND THEIR POWERS

#### 3.1 INTRODUCTION


#### 3.2 PROCEDURAL AND INSTITUTIONAL EVOLUTION

- Europe
- Other Regions

- Mohammed Amin Al-Midani, Human Rights Bodies in the League of Arab States

### 3.3 THE PERSONNEL

#### THE COMPOSITION OF REGIONAL BODIES

- Advisory Opinion on Certain Legal Questions Concerning the Lists of Candidates Submitted with a View to the Election of Judges to the European Court of Human Rights
- Note on the Internal Organization of the European Court of Human Rights

#### SECRETARIATS AND OTHER STAFF MEMBERS

- Challenging the Selection Process for the IACHR Executive Secretary

### 3.4 THE FUNCTIONS AND POWERS OF REGIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS BODIES

#### THE COMMISSIONS

- Certain Attributes of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
- Yuval Ginbar, Human Rights in ASEAN—Setting Sail or Treading Water?

#### THE COURT

- Express and Implied Powers
- Dinah L. Shelton, Form, Function, and the Powers of International Courts

#### OTHER MEANS


### 3.5 PERIODIC STATE REPORTING

- Democratic Republic of the Congo, Periodic Reports to the African Commission

### 3.6 ON-SITE VISITS

### 3.7 THEMATIC STUDIES


### 3.8 INDIVIDUAL AND INTERSTATE COMPLAINTS

#### ADVISORY JURISDICTION

- "Other Treaties" Subject to the Consultative Jurisdiction of the Court (Art. 64 American Convention on Human Rights)

### 3.9 ADVISORY JURISDICTION

#### OTHER TREATIES

- Report on Implementation of Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights
### CONTENTS

#### 3.10.2 The Americas and Africa
- Annual Report of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 2010: 275
- Concluding Questions and Comments: 279

#### CHAPTER IV. COMPLAINT PROCEDURES

**4.1 OVERVIEW**
- *Karner v. Austria*: 281
- Questions and Comments: 285

**4.2 JURISDICTION**
- ASEAN News: 286
- Note on the Matter of Viviana Gallardo et al. and the American Court’s Jurisdiction: 288
- *Personal Jurisdiction (Rationae Personae)*
  - Dudgeon v. United Kingdom: 292
  - Maria Eugenia Morales De Sierra v. Guatemala: 294
  - Questions and Comments: 298
- *Subject Matter Jurisdiction (Rationae Materiae)*
  - Zechnalova & Zehnal v. The Czech Republic: 300
  - Frederick Korvah v. Liberia: 303
  - Questions and Comments: 304
- *Territorial Jurisdiction (Rationae Loci)*
  - Issa and Others v. Turkey: 304
  - Hossein Alikhani v. United States: 308
  - Questions and Comments: 314
- *Temporal Jurisdiction (Rationae Temporis)*
  - Case of Silih v. Slovenia: 316
  - Heliodoro Portugal v. Panama: 325
  - Annette Pagnoulle v. Cameroon: 331
  - Questions and Comments: 334

**4.3 PROTECTIVE MEASURES**
- The Authority to Issue Measures: 336
- International Pen, Constitutional Rights Project, Interights on behalf of Ken Saro-Wiwa Jr. and Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria: 338
- Questions and Comments: 341
- The Rationale, Scope, and Effect of the Measures: 342
- Mamakulov & Askarov v. Turkey: 342
- Letter from the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights: 354
- Questions and Comments: 357

**4.4 ADMISSIBILITY OF COMPLAINTS**
- Overview: 366
- Questions and Comments: 368
- Duplication of Procedures: 369
- *Saramaka People v. Suriname*: 370
- Peraldi v. France: 373
- The Six Months Rule: 375
- *Article 19 and Others v. Zimbabwe*: 376
- Questions and Comments: 379
- Incompatible, Manifestly Ill-Founded, or Abusive of the Right of Petition: 380
- *X. v. Italy*: 380
- *Edson Prado v. Brazil*: 381
- *Ilesanmi v. Nigeria*: 382
- Questions and Comments: 384
- Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies: 385
- *Van Oosterwijck v. Belgium*: 386
- Exceptions to the Requirement: 391
- *Velásquez Rodríguez Case*: 391
- Questions and Comments: 402
- Special Circumstances: Fear and Indigency: 403
- *Chinshamo v. Zimbabwe*: 403
- Exceptions to the Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies: 409
- Questions and Comments: 413
- Significant Disadvantage: 414
- Ladygin v. Russia: 414
- Questions and Comments: 417

**4.5 POSTADMISSIBILITY PROCEDURES**
- Friendly Settlement and Striking Cases: 419
- *Peoples’ Democratic Organization for Independence and Socialism v. The Gambia*: 419
- *Akmant v. Turkey*: 421
- Questions and Comments: 423

---

**4.3.3 The Applicable Standards for Granting Provisional Measures**
- *Four Ngobe Indigenous Communities and Their Members: Request for Provisional Measures*: 358
- Questions and Comments: 364

**4.3.4 Procedural Issues**
- Questions and Comments: 365

---

**4.4 ADMISSIBILITY OF COMPLAINTS**

**4.4.1 Overview**

**4.4.2 Duplication of Procedures**
- *Saramaka People v. Suriname*
- *Peraldi v. France*

**4.4.3 The Six Months Rule**
- *Article 19 and Others v. Zimbabwe*

**4.4.4 Incompatible, Manifestly Ill-Founded, or Abusive of the Right of Petition**
- *X. v. Italy*
- *Edson Prado v. Brazil*
- *Ilesanmi v. Nigeria*

**4.4.5 Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies**
- *Van Oosterwijck v. Belgium*
- Exceptions to the Requirement
- *Velásquez Rodríguez Case*
- *Anuak Justice Council v. Ethiopia*

**4.4.6 Significant Disadvantage**
- *Ladygin v. Russia*
5.6 STATE OBLIGATIONS DURING PERIODS OF EMERGENCY 647
5.6.1 Introduction 647
European Convention on Human Rights, Article 15 648
American Convention on Human Rights, Article 27 648
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Article 4 648
Questions and Comments 649
5.6.2 Examples of Derogations and Suspensions 649
Declaration Contained in a Note Verbale from the Permanent Representation of
the United Kingdom 649
Withdrawal of Derogation Contained in a Note Verbale from the Permanent
Representation of the United Kingdom 651
Declaration Contained in a Letter from the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Georgia
Colombia 652
Ecuador 652
5.6.3 Jurisprudence 653
Ireland v. The United Kingdom 653
Aksoy v. Turkey 663
Habeas Corpus in Emergency Situations 670
Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency 674
Honduras: Human Rights and the Coup D'état 678
Commission Nationale des Droits de l'Homme et des Libérés v. Chad 682
Questions and Comments 684

CHAPTER VI. JURISPRUDENCE ON SELECTED RIGHTS 687
6.1 THE RIGHT TO LIFE AND THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY 687
Res. 23/81, Case 2141 (USA) 688
Murillo v. Costa Rica 692
V.O. v. France 697
S.H. v. Austria 701
Questions and Comments 708
6.2 THE RIGHT TO PHYSICAL AND PERSONAL INTEGRITY 710
Tyrer v. United Kingdom 710
Doebbler v. Sudan 713
Caesar v. Trinidad and Tobago 714
Questions and Comments 719
6.3 DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS AND THE RIGHT TO POLITICAL PARTICIPATION 720
Refah Partisi (The Welfare Party) v. Turkey 720
Legal Resources Foundation v. Zambia 728
Castaneda-Gutman v. México 732
Questions and Comments 740

CHAPTER VII. RESPONDING TO WIDESPREAD VIOLATIONS 837
7.1 MODIFYING PROCEDURAL RULES 838
7.1.1 Admissibility and Standards of Proof 838
Amnesty International v. Sudan 838
Akdivar and Others v. Turkey 841
Questions and Comments 845
7.1.2 Addressing Systemic Problems in the European System 845
Bottazzi v. Italy 846
Apicella v. Italy 847
Broniowski v. Poland 859
Note on the Aftermath of the Broniowski Judgment 866
Resolution (2004)3 on Judgments Revealing an Underlying Systemic Problem 868
Questions and Comments 869
7.2 INTERSTATE CASES 870
Ireland v. United Kingdom 871
Soren C. Prebensen, Inter-State Complaints under Treaty Provisions—
The Experience under the European Convention on Human Rights 877
## 7.3 COUNTRY REPORTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country Reports: Democracy and Human Rights in Venezuela</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>901</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 7.4 CONDENMATORIES RESOLUTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resolution on the Situation of Human Rights in Ethiopia</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>915</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 7.5 AMNESTIES AND LUSTRATION

### 7.5.1 Amnesties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country: Chile</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>923</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 7.5.2 Lustration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case: Rios Montt v. Guatemala</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>943</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 7.6 REPARATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case: IACHR Principal Guidelines for a Comprehensive Reparations Policy</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>954</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 8.1 STRENGTHENING THE EXISTING SYSTEMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue: Responding to the Rising Caseload in Europe</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>979</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Final Report of the Group of Wise Persons to the Committee of Ministers</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>980</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opinion of the Court on the Wise Persons' Report</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>985</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 8.2 DRAFTING NEW INSTRUMENTS

### 8.2.1 Report of the Brainstorming Meeting on the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (ACHPR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 8.2.2 African Union Draft Protocol on Amendments to the Protocol on the Statute of the African Court of Justice and Human Rights

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1020</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 8.3 NEW REGIONAL SYSTEMS?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Human Rights in the Asia-Pacific: Challenges and Opportunities</th>
<th>Questions and Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1049</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concluding Questions and Comments</th>
<th>Final Note: A Danger of Regression?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1051</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Table of Cases

Index