

REGIONAL PROTECTION  
OF HUMAN RIGHTS

REGIONAL PROTECTION  
OF HUMAN RIGHTS



*Dinah L. Shelton*

*Paolo G. Carozza*

OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

---

## CONTENTS



<i>Foreword</i>	xxiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xxv
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xxvii
<i>Bibliographical Note on Print and Internet Resources</i>	xxix

---

### CHAPTER I. REGIONAL ORGANIZATIONS AND HUMAN RIGHTS 1

---

<b>1.1 THE EVOLUTION OF INTERNATIONAL CONCERN WITH HUMAN RIGHTS</b>	1
Louis B. Sohn, <i>The New International Law: Protection of the Rights of Individuals Rather than States</i>	1
Dinah L. Shelton, <i>The Promise of Regional Human Rights Systems</i>	11
Questions and Comments	12
<b>1.2 EUROPEAN REGIONAL ORGANIZATIONS</b>	13
1.2.1 The Council of Europe	13
Statute of the Council of Europe (extracts)	13
Human Rights Standard-Setting by the Council of Europe	14
Applicants for Membership: The Case of Belarus	19
Eur. Parl. Assembly, <i>Situation in Belarus</i>	20
Eur. Parl. Assembly Debate, <i>Situation in Belarus</i>	22
Questions and Comments	24

Constitution of South Africa	119
Constitution of the United Mexican States	119
2.2.2 Commentary and Jurisprudence	120
Janet Koven Levit, <i>The Constitutionalization of Human Rights in Argentina: Problem or Promise?</i>	120
<i>Good v. Republic of Botswana</i>	122
<hr/>	
<b>2.3 SELF-EXECUTING AND NON-SELF-EXECUTING TREATIES</b>	126
Thomas Buergenthal, <i>Self-Executing and Non-Self-Executing Treaties in National and International Law</i>	126
<i>International Responsibility for the Promulgation and Enforcement of Laws in Violation of the Convention (Arts. 1 and 2 of the American Convention on Human Rights)</i>	127
<i>Legal Resources Foundation v. Zambia</i>	129
<i>Civil Liberties Organization v. Nigeria</i>	132
Questions and Comments	133
<hr/>	
<b>2.4 RESERVATIONS TO HUMAN RIGHTS TREATIES</b>	135
2.4.1 Europe	135
Article 64, European Convention on Human Rights	135
2.4.2 The Americas	136
Inter-Am. Ct. H.R., <i>Restrictions to the Death Penalty</i>	136
Questions and Comments	142
<hr/>	
<b>2.5 THE OBLIGATIONS OF FEDERAL STATES</b>	145
Thomas Buergenthal, <i>The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights</i>	145
Johanna Kalb, <i>Dynamic Federalism in Human Rights Treaty Implementation</i>	147
Concluding Questions and Comments	150
<hr/>	
<b>CHAPTER III. THE REGIONAL INSTITUTIONS AND THEIR POWERS</b>	153
<hr/>	
<b>3.1 INTRODUCTION</b>	153
Christof Heyns, <i>The African Regional Human Rights System: The African Charter</i>	153
<hr/>	
<b>3.2 PROCEDURAL AND INSTITUTIONAL EVOLUTION</b>	154
3.2.1 Europe	154
3.2.2 Other Regions	157
Mohammed Amin Al-Midani, <i>Human Rights Bodies in the League of Arab States</i>	159

<b>3.3 THE PERSONNEL</b>	169
3.3.1 The Composition of Regional Bodies	169
<i>Advisory Opinion on Certain Legal Questions Concerning the Lists of Candidates Submitted with a View to the Election of Judges to the European Court of Human Rights</i>	170
Note on the Internal Organization of the European Court of Human Rights	176
Questions and Comments	176
3.3.2 Secretariats and Other Staff Members	178
<i>Challenging the Selection Process for the IACHR Executive Secretary</i>	179
Questions and Comments	181
<hr/>	
<b>3.4 THE FUNCTIONS AND POWERS OF REGIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS BODIES</b>	182
3.4.1 Overview of the Mandates	182
<i>Certain Attributes of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights</i>	183
Questions and Comments	189
Yuval Ginbar, <i>Human Rights in ASEAN—Setting Sail or Treading Water?</i>	191
3.4.2 Express and Implied Powers	194
Dinah L. Shelton, <i>Form, Function, and the Powers of International Courts</i>	194
<i>Communication 373/2009 (formerly 242/2001)—Interights, Institute for Human Rights and Development in Africa, and Association Mauritanienne des Droits de l'Homme v. Islamic Republic of Mauritania</i>	200
Questions and Comments	207
<hr/>	
<b>3.5 PERIODIC STATE REPORTING</b>	207
<i>Democratic Republic of the Congo, Periodic Reports to the African Commission</i>	208
<i>ACHPR, Report of the 48th Ordinary Session</i>	225
Questions and Comments	228
<hr/>	
<b>3.6 ON-SITE VISITS</b>	228
<hr/>	
<b>3.7 THEMATIC STUDIES</b>	229
<i>Report on Citizen Security and Human Rights</i>	230
Questions and Comments	245
<hr/>	
<b>3.8 INDIVIDUAL AND INTERSTATE COMPLAINTS</b>	245
<hr/>	
<b>3.9 ADVISORY JURISDICTION</b>	245
<i>"Other Treaties" Subject to the Consultative Jurisdiction of the Court (Art. 64 American Convention on Human Rights)</i>	247
Questions and Comments	255
<hr/>	
<b>3.10 COMPLIANCE MONITORING</b>	256
3.10.1 Europe	256
<i>Report on Implementation of Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights</i>	257

3.10.2	The Americas and Africa	263
	Annual Report of the Inter American Commission on Human Rights 2009	264
	Frans Viljoen & Lirette Louw, <i>State Compliance with the Recommendations of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1994-2004</i>	265
	Annual Report of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights 2010	275
	Concluding Questions and Comments	279
<hr/>		
CHAPTER IV. COMPLAINT PROCEDURES		281
<hr/>		
4.1	OVERVIEW	281
	<i>Karner v. Austria</i>	282
	Questions and Comments	285
<hr/>		
4.2	JURISDICTION	286
	ASEAN News	287
	Note on the <i>Matter of Viviana Gallardo et al.</i> and the American Court's Jurisdiction	288
4.2.1	Personal Jurisdiction ( <i>Rationae Personae</i> )	292
	<i>Dudgeon v. United Kingdom</i>	292
	<i>Maria Eugenia Morales De Sierra v. Guatemala</i>	294
	Questions and Comments	298
4.2.2	Subject Matter Jurisdiction ( <i>Rationae Materiae</i> )	300
	<i>Zechmalova &amp; Zehnal v. The Czech Republic</i>	300
	<i>Frederick Korvah v. Liberia</i>	303
	Questions and Comments	304
4.2.3	Territorial Jurisdiction ( <i>Rationae Loci</i> )	304
	<i>Issa and Others v. Turkey</i>	305
	<i>Hossein Alikhani v. United States</i>	308
	Questions and Comments	314
4.2.4	Temporal Jurisdiction ( <i>Rationae Temporis</i> )	316
	<i>Case of Šilih v. Slovenia</i>	316
	<i>Heliodoro Portugal v. Panama</i>	325
	<i>Annette Pagnouille v. Cameroon</i>	331
	Questions and Comments	334
<hr/>		
4.3	PROTECTIVE MEASURES	335
4.3.1	The Authority to Issue Measures	336
	<i>International Pen, Constitutional Rights Project, Interights on behalf of Ken Saro-Wiwa Jr. and Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria</i>	338
	Questions and Comments	341
4.3.2	The Rationale, Scope, and Effect of the Measures	342
	<i>Mamatkulov &amp; Askarov v. Turkey</i>	342
	<i>Letter from the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights</i>	354
	Questions and Comments	357

4.3.3	The Applicable Standards for Granting <i>Four Ngöbe Indigenous Communities and Their Members: Request for Provisional Measures</i>	358
	Questions and Comments	364
4.3.4	Procedural Issues	365
	Questions and Comments	365
<hr/>		
4.4	ADMISSIBILITY OF COMPLAINTS	366
4.4.1	Overview	366
	<i>Velasquez Rodriguez v. Honduras</i> (Preliminary Objections)	367
	Questions and Comments	368
4.4.2	Duplication of Procedures	369
	<i>Saramaka People v. Suriname</i>	370
	<i>Peraldi v. France</i>	373
4.4.3	The Six Months Rule	375
	<i>Article 19 and Others v. Zimbabwe</i>	376
	Questions and Comments	379
4.4.4	Incompatible, Manifestly Ill-Founded, or Abusive of the Right of Petition	380
	<i>X. v. Iceland</i>	380
	<i>Edson Prado v. Brazil</i>	381
	<i>Iiesanmi v. Nigeria</i>	382
	Questions and Comments	384
4.4.5	Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies	385
	The Substance and Purpose of the Rule	386
	<i>Van Oosterwijck v. Belgium</i>	386
	Exceptions to the Requirement	391
	<i>Velásquez Rodríguez Case</i>	391
	<i>Anuak Justice Council v. Ethiopia</i>	395
	Questions and Comments	402
	Special Circumstances: Fear and Indigency	403
	<i>Chinhamo v. Zimbabwe</i>	403
	<i>Exceptions to the Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies</i>	409
	Questions and Comments	413
4.4.6	Significant Disadvantage	414
	<i>Ladygin v. Russia</i>	414
	Questions and Comments	417
<hr/>		
4.5	POSTADMISSIBILITY PROCEDURES	417
4.5.1	Friendly Settlement and Striking Cases	419
	<i>Peoples' Democratic Organization for Independence and Socialism v. The Gambia</i>	419
	<i>Akman v. Turkey</i>	421
	Questions and Comments	423

4.5.2	Proving the Case	423
	<i>Rosa Ana Frigerio v. Argentina</i>	424
	<i>Velásquez Rodríguez Case</i>	428
	Questions and Comments	436
	<i>Kurt v. Turkey</i>	438
	<i>Sevtap Veznedaroglu v. Turkey</i>	447
	Questions and Comments	453
<hr/>		
4.6	REMEDIES FOR HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS	454
4.6.1	The Purpose of Proceedings and the Role of Remedies	457
	<i>Case of Varnava and Others v. Turkey</i>	457
	Questions and Comments	464
4.6.2	The Scope of Remedies	464
	Compensation	466
	<i>Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname</i>	468
	Questions and Comments	479
	Restitution	481
	<i>Brumarescu v. Romania</i>	481
	Nonmonetary Remedies	483
	<i>Loayza-Tamayo v. Peru</i>	484
	Questions and Comments	500
	<i>Sudan Human Rights v. Sudan</i>	503
	Costs and Fees	504
	Concluding Questions and Comments	506
<hr/>		
CHAPTER V. APPLYING REGIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTRUMENTS		507
<hr/>		
5.1	HUMAN RIGHTS TREATY INTERPRETATION	507
	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	507
5.1.1	Dynamic Interpretation	508
	<i>Demir and Baykara v. Turkey</i>	508
	<i>Bayatyan v. Armenia</i>	512
	Questions and Comments	518
5.1.2	Implied Rights	519
	<i>Johnston and Others v. Ireland</i>	520
	<i>SERAC v. Nigeria</i>	523
	Questions and Comments	525
<hr/>		
5.2	SUBSIDIARITY, DEFERENCE, AND PLURALISM	527
5.2.1	General Principles	527
	P. Carozza, <i>Subsidiarity as a Structural Principle of International Human Rights Law</i>	527
	Questions and Comments	528

5.2.2	Deference to National Authorities	528
	Y. Shany, <i>Toward a General Margin of Appreciation Doctrine in International Law?</i>	528
	<i>Stokes v. Jamaica</i>	530
5.2.3	Normative Pluralism	536
	<i>Lautsi v. Italy</i>	536
	Questions and Comments	545
<hr/>		
5.3	RELATIONSHIPS AMONG REGIONAL AND UNIVERSAL NORMS	546
5.3.1	Universal Norms in Regional Systems	546
	<i>Nachova v. Bulgaria</i>	546
	<i>Al-Adsani v. The United Kingdom</i>	552
	Questions and Comments	556
5.3.2	The Right of Peoples to Self-Determination	558
	<i>Kevin Mgwanga Gunme v. Cameroon</i>	559
	Questions and Comments	569
5.3.3	Interrelationship of Regional Norms	570
	<i>Compulsory Membership in an Association Prescribed by Law for the Practice of Journalism</i>	572
	Questions and Comments	574
<hr/>		
5.4	STATE OBLIGATIONS	575
5.4.1	Attribution of Responsibility to the State	575
	<i>Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras</i>	576
	<i>Assanidze v. Georgia</i>	580
	<i>Woś v. Poland</i>	585
	<i>Chahal v. The United Kingdom</i>	591
	Questions and Comments	598
5.4.2	The Nature of State Obligations	599
	<i>González et al. ("Cotton Field") v. Mexico</i>	599
	<i>Öneryildiz v. Turkey</i>	614
	Note on the Duty of Care to Protect Life	622
	A. R. Mowbray, <i>The Development of Positive Obligations under the European Convention on Human Rights by the European Court of Human Rights</i>	624
	Questions and Comments	629
<hr/>		
5.5	LIMITATIONS AND CLAWBACK CLAUSES	630
5.5.1	Limitation Clauses	630
	<i>The Word "Laws" in Article 30 of the American Convention on Human Rights</i>	630
	<i>Hirst v. The United Kingdom (No. 2)</i>	636
	Questions and Comments	644
5.5.2	Clawback Clauses	644
	<i>Amnesty International v. Zambia</i>	644
	Questions and Comments	645

5.6	STATE OBLIGATIONS DURING PERIODS OF EMERGENCY	647
5.6.1	Introduction	647
	European Convention on Human Rights, Article 15	648
	American Convention on Human Rights, Article 27	648
	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Article 4	648
	Questions and Comments	649
5.6.2	Examples of Derogations and Suspensions	649
	<i>Declaration Contained in a Note Verbale from the Permanent Representation of the United Kingdom</i>	649
	<i>Withdrawal of Derogation Contained in a Note Verbale from the Permanent Representation of the United Kingdom</i>	651
	<i>Declaration Contained in a Letter from the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Georgia</i>	651
	Colombia	652
	Ecuador	652
5.6.3	Jurisprudence	653
	<i>Ireland v. The United Kingdom</i>	653
	<i>Aksoy v. Turkey</i>	663
	<i>Habeas Corpus in Emergency Situations</i>	670
	<i>Judicial Guarantees in States of Emergency</i>	674
	<i>Honduras: Human Rights and the Coup D'état</i>	678
	<i>Commission Nationale des Droits de l'Homme et des Libertés v. Chad</i>	682
	Questions and Comments	684
 CHAPTER VI. JURISPRUDENCE ON SELECTED RIGHTS		687
6.1	THE RIGHT TO LIFE AND THE RIGHT TO PRIVACY	687
	Res. 23/81, <i>Case 2141 (USA)</i>	688
	<i>Murillo v. Costa Rica</i>	692
	<i>V.O. v. France</i>	697
	<i>S.H. v. Austria</i>	701
	Questions and Comments	708
6.2	THE RIGHT TO PHYSICAL AND PERSONAL INTEGRITY	710
	<i>Tyrer v. United Kingdom</i>	710
	<i>Doebbler v. Sudan</i>	713
	<i>Caesar v. Trinidad and Tobago</i>	714
	Questions and Comments	719
6.3	DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS AND THE RIGHT TO POLITICAL PARTICIPATION	720
	<i>Refah Partisi (The Welfare Party) v. Turkey</i>	720
	<i>Legal Resources Foundation v. Zambia</i>	728
	<i>Castañeda-Gutman v. México</i>	732
	Questions and Comments	740

6.4	ECONOMIC, SOCIAL, AND CULTURAL RIGHTS	741
6.4.1	Africa	741
	<i>SERAC v. Nigeria</i>	741
6.4.2	Europe	745
	<i>Taskin and Others v. Turkey</i>	745
	<i>European Roma Rights Centre v. Italy</i>	748
6.4.3	Americas	753
	<i>Acevedo Buendía v. Perú</i>	754
	<i>Xákmok Kásek Indigenous Community v. Paraguay</i>	757
	Questions and Comments	763
6.5	COLLECTIVE RIGHTS OF INDIGENOUS AND TRIBAL PEOPLES	767
	<i>Saramaka People v. Suriname</i>	767
	<i>Centre for Minority Rights Development v. Kenya</i>	782
	Questions and Comments	800
6.6	FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	801
	<i>Cumpănă and Mazăre v. Romania</i>	808
	<i>Usón Ramírez v. Venezuela</i>	817
	<i>Scanlen &amp; Holderness v. Zimbabwe</i>	825
	Questions and Comments	833
 CHAPTER VII. RESPONDING TO WIDESPREAD VIOLATIONS		837
7.1	MODIFYING PROCEDURAL RULES	838
7.1.1	Admissibility and Standards of Proof	838
	<i>Amnesty International v. Sudan</i>	838
	<i>Akdivar and Others v. Turkey</i>	841
	Questions and Comments	845
7.1.2	Addressing Systemic Problems in the European System	845
	<i>Bottazzi v. Italy</i>	846
	<i>Apicella v. Italy</i>	847
	<i>Broniowski v. Poland</i>	859
	Note on the Aftermath of the <i>Broniowski</i> Judgment	866
	<i>Resolution (2004)3 on Judgments Revealing an Underlying Systemic Problem</i>	868
	Questions and Comments	869
7.2	INTERSTATE CASES	870
	<i>Ireland v. United Kingdom</i>	871
	<i>Søren C. Prebensen, Inter-State Complaints under Treaty Provisions—</i>	
	<i>The Experience under the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	877

	<i>D. R. Congo v. Burundi, Rwanda, and Uganda</i>	878
	<i>Nicaragua v. Costa Rica</i>	886
	Questions and Comments	899
<b>7.3</b>	<b>COUNTRY REPORTS</b>	901
	<i>Democracy and Human Rights in Venezuela</i>	902
	Questions and Comments	913
<b>7.4</b>	<b>CONDEMNATORY RESOLUTIONS</b>	914
	<i>Resolution on the Situation of Human Rights in Ethiopia</i>	915
	<i>Submission by the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia</i>	916
	<i>Resolution on the Situation of Human Rights in the Darfur Region in Sudan</i>	919
	<i>Comments of the Sudan</i>	920
	Questions and Comments	922
<b>7.5</b>	<b>AMNESTIES AND LUSTRATION</b>	922
<b>7.5.1</b>	<b>Amnesties</b>	923
	<i>Chile</i>	923
	Note on El Salvador's Amnesty Law	927
	<i>Barrios Altos Case (Chumbipuma Aguirre et al. v. Peru)</i>	929
	<i>Gomes Lund et al. ("Guerrilha Do Araguaia") v. Brazil</i>	931
	Questions and Comments	942
<b>7.5.2</b>	<b>Lustration</b>	943
	<i>Rios Montt v. Guatemala</i>	943
	<i>Rainys and Gasparavičius v. Lithuania</i>	948
	Questions and Comments	954
<b>7.6</b>	<b>REPARATIONS</b>	954
	<i>IACHR Principal Guidelines for a Comprehensive Reparations Policy</i>	955
	<i>Chitay Nech et al. v. Guatemala</i>	957
	Concluding Comments	978
<b>CHAPTER VIII. TOWARD THE FUTURE</b>		979
<b>8.1</b>	<b>STRENGTHENING THE EXISTING SYSTEMS</b>	979
<b>8.1.1</b>	<b>Responding to the Rising Caseload in Europe</b>	979
	<i>Final Report of the Group of Wise Persons to the Committee of Ministers</i>	980
	<i>Opinion of the Court on the Wise Persons' Report</i>	985
	Questions and Comments	989
<b>8.1.2</b>	<b>Increasing the Effectiveness of the Inter-American System</b>	992
	<i>Strategic Plan 2011–2015</i>	992
	<i>Report of the Special Working Group to Reflect on the Workings of the IACHR</i>	999
	Questions and Comments	1009

<b>8.1.3</b>	<b>Institutional Reform in the African System</b>	1010
	<i>Report of the Brainstorming Meeting on the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (ACHPR)</i>	1010
	Questions and Comments	1018
<b>8.2</b>	<b>DRAFTING NEW INSTRUMENTS</b>	1018
	<i>African Union Draft Protocol on Amendments to the Protocol on the Statute of the African Court of Justice and Human Rights</i>	1020
	Questions and Comments	1028
<b>8.3</b>	<b>NEW REGIONAL SYSTEMS?</b>	1030
	<i>Human Rights in the Asia-Pacific: Challenges and Opportunities</i>	1031
	Concluding Questions and Comments	1049
	Final Note: A Danger of Regression?	1049
	<i>Table of Cases</i>	1051
	<i>Index</i>	1067