

Corruption: A Violation of Human Rights and  
a Crime Under International Law?

Martine Boersma

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 56

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

our laughs accompanied by *un pèlske in de kaffees vaan Mestreech* were always inspiring and encouraging.

Finally, I'd like to express my utmost gratitude to my parents Eleonora and Alexander, to whom this book is dedicated. *Vaanoet de grond vaan mien hart daank iech uuch veur alle steun, mèt zoe vööl dinger. Dit 'beukske' is veerdig, en iech hoop tot geer gruuts kint zien. Unne hiele groete merci!*

Maastricht, July 2012

## CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i> .....	xxi

<b>General Introduction</b> .....	1
1. A Day in the Life of John and Jane Doe .....	1
2. Overview of Contemporary Research .....	2
2.1. Corruption as a Violation of Human Rights? .....	2
2.2. Corruption as a Crime under International Law? .....	7
3. Main Research Questions .....	9
4. Structure .....	9
4.1. Part A: The Phenomenon of Corruption: An Introductory Analysis .....	9
4.2. Part B: Responsibility of States: Corruption as a Violation of Human Rights? .....	10
4.3. Part C: Individual Responsibility: Corruption as a Crime under International Law? .....	11
4.4. Part D: Summary, Reflections and Recommendations .....	12
5. Methodology .....	12
5.1. Part A: The Phenomenon of Corruption: An Introductory Analysis .....	12
5.2. Part B: Responsibility of States: Corruption as a Violation of Human Rights? .....	13
5.2.1. Data Collection and Organisation .....	13
5.2.2. Interpretation of Results .....	19
5.3. Part C: Individual Responsibility: Corruption as a Crime under International Law? .....	20
5.3.1. Data Collection and Organisation .....	20
5.3.2. Interpretation of Results .....	21

### PART A THE PHENOMENON OF CORRUPTION: AN INTRODUCTORY ANALYSIS

<b>Chapter I</b>	
<b>Basic Issues</b> .....	25
1. Introduction .....	25
2. Defining 'Corruption' .....	27
2.1. Public and Private Sector Corruption .....	27
2.2. Grand and Petty Corruption .....	29

2.3. Corruption <i>vis-à-vis</i> Other Concepts . . . . .	30
2.4. Cultural Connotations . . . . .	32
3. Typology of Corruption . . . . .	33
3.1. Introductory Remarks . . . . .	33
3.2. Bribery . . . . .	33
3.3. Embezzlement . . . . .	35
3.4. Trading in Influence . . . . .	35
3.5. Abuse of Functions . . . . .	36
3.5.1. Patronage . . . . .	36
3.5.2. Nepotism . . . . .	37
3.6. Illicit Enrichment . . . . .	38
4. Measuring Corruption . . . . .	38
5. The Harmfulness of Corruption . . . . .	40
5.1. Introductory Remarks . . . . .	40
5.2. Political Consequences . . . . .	41
5.2.1. Erosion of Democracy and Legitimacy . . . . .	41
5.2.2. Armed Conflict . . . . .	41
5.3. Economic Consequences . . . . .	45
5.4. Social Consequences . . . . .	48
5.5. Environmental Consequences . . . . .	49
6. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	51
<b>Chapter II</b>	
<b>Global and Regional Legal Framework Against Corruption . . . . .</b>	<b>53</b>
1. Introduction . . . . .	53
2. International Regulation of Corruption . . . . .	54
2.1. The Precursory Role of the US Foreign Corrupt Practices Act . . . . .	54
2.1.1. Content . . . . .	54
2.1.2. Underlying Motives for Adoption . . . . .	55
2.1.3. Criticisms and Resulting Amendments . . . . .	56
2.1.4. Enforcement and Effectiveness . . . . .	58
2.2. Rationales for International Legislative Efforts . . . . .	61
2.2.1. US Lobbying Efforts . . . . .	61
2.2.2. Societal Developments . . . . .	62
3. Legal Instruments on the Global and Regional Plane . . . . .	64
3.1. Inter-American Convention Against Corruption (1996) . . . . .	64
3.1.1. Content . . . . .	64
3.1.2. Follow-up Mechanism (MESICIC) . . . . .	67
3.2. European Union . . . . .	70
3.2.1. PFI Convention (1995), First Protocol (1996) and Second Protocol (1997) . . . . .	70

3.2.2. Convention on the Fight Against Corruption Involving Officials of the European Communities or Officials of EU Member States (1997) . . . . .	71
3.2.3. Other Developments . . . . .	72
3.3. OECD Convention on Combating Bribery of Foreign Public Officials in International Business Transactions (1997) . . . . .	73
3.3.1. Content . . . . .	73
3.3.2. Monitoring Mechanism . . . . .	77
3.4. Council of Europe . . . . .	81
3.4.1. Criminal Law Convention on Corruption (1999) and Additional Protocol (2003) . . . . .	81
3.4.2. Civil Law Convention on Corruption (1999) . . . . .	82
3.4.3. Recommendation on Codes of Conduct for Public Officials (2000) . . . . .	83
3.4.4. Recommendation on Common Rules against Corruption in the Funding of Political Parties and Electoral Campaigns (2003) . . . . .	83
3.4.5. GRECO: the COE's Monitoring Mechanism . . . . .	84
3.5. African Instruments . . . . .	85
3.5.1. SADC Protocol Against Corruption (2001) . . . . .	85
3.5.2. ECOWAS Protocol on the Fight Against Corruption (2001) . . . . .	88
3.5.3. African Union Convention on Preventing and Combating Corruption (2003) . . . . .	88
3.6. United Nations . . . . .	92
3.6.1. United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime (2000) . . . . .	92
3.6.2. United Nations Convention Against Corruption (2003) . . . . .	93
4. Comparative Analysis . . . . .	97

**PART B**

**RESPONSIBILITY OF STATES: CORRUPTION AS A VIOLATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS?**

**Chapter III**

<b>Treaty-Based System: Corruption as a Topic in the Work of the UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies . . . . .</b>	<b>103</b>
1. Introduction . . . . .	103
2. State Reporting Procedure . . . . .	104
2.1. Overview . . . . .	104
2.2. Language Employed in the Treaty Bodies' Concluding Observations . . . . .	105
3. Individual Complaints Procedure . . . . .	108
4. Human Rights Committee (HRC) . . . . .	109
4.1. Concluding Observations . . . . .	109

4.1.1. The Right to Equality Before Courts and Tribunals and to a Fair Trial . . . . .	109
4.1.2. The Prohibition of Human Trafficking . . . . .	112
4.1.3. The Right to Freedom of Movement . . . . .	112
4.1.4. Miscellaneous Observations . . . . .	113
4.2. Views on Individual Complaints . . . . .	114
5. Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) . . . . .	116
6. Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC) . . . . .	120
7. Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) . . . . .	125
8. Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) . . . . .	126
9. Committee Against Torture (CAT) . . . . .	128
10. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	130
<b>Chapter IV</b>	
<b>Charter-Based System: Corruption as a Topic in the UPR and the Special Procedures of the UN Human Rights Council . . . . .</b>	<b>135</b>
1. Introduction . . . . .	135
2. Universal Periodic Review . . . . .	135
2.1. Background . . . . .	135
2.2. Discussion of Corruption During the UPR Dialogue . . . . .	136
2.2.1. Statements by States under Review . . . . .	137
2.2.2. Comments and Questions by Reviewing States . . . . .	139
2.2.3. Recommendations Made to States under Review . . . . .	141
2.2.4. Countries in Respect of Which Corruption is Discussed . . . . .	142
2.2.5. Countries Commenting, Asking, Recommending about Corruption . . . . .	143
2.2.6. The Relationship Between Corruption and Human Rights Violations . . . . .	144
2.3. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	145
3. Special Procedures of the UN Human Rights Council . . . . .	145
3.1. Background . . . . .	145
3.2. The Former Special Rapporteur on Corruption and Its Impact on the Full Enjoyment of Human Rights, in Particular Economic, Social and Cultural Rights . . . . .	147
3.2.1. Introduction . . . . .	147
3.2.2. Outcomes . . . . .	148
3.2.3. Assessment . . . . .	150
3.3. Other Selected Thematic Mandates . . . . .	150
3.3.1. Introduction . . . . .	150
3.3.2. Outcomes . . . . .	151
3.3.3. Assessment . . . . .	164

3.4. Country Mandates . . . . .	165
3.4.1. Introduction . . . . .	165
3.4.2. Outcomes . . . . .	166
3.4.3. Assessment . . . . .	174
3.5. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	174
<b>Chapter V</b>	
<b>Regional Human Rights Practice on the Topic of Corruption . . . . .</b>	<b>177</b>
1. Introduction . . . . .	177
2. Europe . . . . .	177
2.1. Background . . . . .	177
2.2. Practice of the European Court of Human Rights . . . . .	178
2.2.1. Whistleblowers' Right to Freedom of Expression (Article 10 ECHR) . . . . .	178
2.2.2. Rights of Persons Accused of Corruption . . . . .	181
3. The Americas . . . . .	185
3.1. Background . . . . .	185
3.2. Practice of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights . . . . .	186
3.2.1. Corruption in the Judiciary . . . . .	186
3.2.2. Rights of Whistleblowers . . . . .	188
3.2.3. Economic, Social and Cultural Rights . . . . .	188
3.2.4. Other Issues . . . . .	189
3.3. Practice of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights . . . . .	190
4. Africa . . . . .	192
4.1. Background . . . . .	192
4.2. Practice of the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights . . . . .	192
5. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	193
<b>Chapter VI</b>	
<b>Taking It Further: Corruption as a Human Rights Violation . . . . .</b>	<b>195</b>
1. Introduction . . . . .	195
2. Clarifying the Corruption and Human Rights Connection . . . . .	195
2.1. Introduction . . . . .	195
2.2. ICHRP's Approach: Various Types of 'Violations' . . . . .	196
2.3. Alternative Approach: 'Dimensions' of the Corruption and Human Rights Connection . . . . .	197
2.4. Opposition to the Corruption and Human Rights Connection . . . . .	200
3. Corruption as a Violation of Civil and Political Rights . . . . .	202
3.1. The Right to Equality and Non-Discrimination . . . . .	202
3.1.1. Introduction . . . . .	202
3.1.2. The Right to Equality Before the Law . . . . .	204

3.1.3. The Right to Equal Protection of the Law .....	204
3.1.4. The Prohibition of Discrimination .....	204
3.2. The Right to Equality Before Courts and Tribunals and the Right to a Fair Trial .....	205
3.2.1. Introduction .....	205
3.2.2. The Right to Equality Before Courts and Tribunals .....	207
3.2.3. The Right to a Fair Trial .....	209
3.2.4. The Presumption of Innocence .....	211
3.2.5. Rights of Persons Charged with a Criminal Offense .....	211
3.2.6. The Right to a Remedy .....	212
3.3. Rights of Political Participation .....	212
3.3.1. Introduction .....	212
3.3.2. The Right to Take Part in the Conduct of Public Affairs .....	214
3.3.3. The Right to Vote .....	214
3.3.4. The Right to be Elected .....	215
3.3.5. The Right of Equal Access to Public Service .....	216
3.4. The Prohibition of Human Trafficking .....	216
3.4.1. Introduction .....	216
3.4.2. State Obligations under the Trafficking Protocol .....	218
3.4.3. Article 8 ICCPR .....	218
3.5. The Rights of Detainees to be Treated with Humanity and Dignity .....	222
3.5.1. Introduction .....	222
3.5.2. Article 10 ICCPR .....	222
3.6. The Right to Freedom of Movement .....	224
3.6.1. Introduction .....	224
3.6.2. The Right to Liberty of Movement and Freedom to Choose Residence .....	225
3.6.3. The Freedom to Leave a Country and Liberty of Emigration .....	226
3.6.4. The Right to Enter One's Own Country .....	228
4. Corruption as a Violation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....	228
4.1. State Party Obligations under Article 2(1) ICESCR .....	228
4.1.1. Introduction .....	228
4.1.2. 'Undertakes To Take Steps' .....	229
4.1.3. 'Individually and Through International Assistance and Co-operation, Especially Economic and Technical' .....	230
4.1.4. 'To the Maximum of Its Available Resources' .....	231
4.1.5. 'With a View to Achieving Progressively the Full Realisation of the Rights Recognised in the Covenant' .....	232
4.1.6. 'By all Appropriate Means, Including Particularly the Adoption of Legislative Measures' .....	233
4.2. The Right to Food .....	234
4.2.1. Introduction .....	234
4.2.2. Content .....	235

4.2.3. State Obligations and Violations .....	236
4.2. The Right to Adequate Housing .....	239
4.3.1. Introduction .....	239
4.3.2. Content .....	240
4.3.3. State Obligations and Violations .....	242
4.4. The Right to Education .....	244
4.4.1. Introduction .....	244
4.4.2. Content .....	246
4.4.3. State Obligations and Violations .....	250
4.5. The Right to Health .....	252
4.5.1. Introduction .....	252
4.5.2. Content .....	254
4.5.3. State Obligations and Violations .....	258
5. Towards a New Human Right to a Corruption-Free Society? .....	264
6. Concluding Remarks: The Merits and Limits of the Human Rights Approach to Corruption .....	267
6.1. General Conclusions .....	267
6.2. Employing the UN Treaty Bodies .....	268
6.3. The Role of the Human Rights Council: UPR and Special Procedures .....	269
6.4. Bringing Corruption Before Regional Human Rights Instances .....	270
6.5. Domestic Human Rights Litigation .....	271
6.6. National Human Rights Institutions (NHRIs) .....	272
6.7. Cooperation between Human Rights Actors and Anti-Corruption Organisations .....	274

**PART C**

**INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITY: CORRUPTION AS A CRIME UNDER INTERNATIONAL  
LAW?**

**Chapter VII**

<b>Situating Corruption Within International Criminal Law .....</b>	<b>277</b>
1. Introduction .....	277
2. Key Concepts .....	278
2.1. ICL <i>largo sensu</i> : ICL <i>stricto sensu</i> and Transnational Criminal Law ..	278
2.2. International Crimes: Crimes under International Law and Transnational Crimes .....	279
3. Corruption in International Criminal Law from a Historical Perspective ..	283
3.1. Developments until World War I .....	283
3.2. Post-World War I .....	284
3.3. Post-World War II .....	285
3.4. The International Criminal Court .....	287
3.4.1. Developments Leading to the ICC's Establishment .....	287

3.4.2. <i>Travaux Préparatoires</i> of the Rome Statute . . . . .	291
3.5. Findings . . . . .	294
4. Rationales for the International Criminalisation of Corruption . . . . .	295
4.1. Introduction: Developing a Model for International Criminalisation . . . . .	295
4.2. Feasibility and Motivation of Harm . . . . .	296
4.2.1. Content . . . . .	296
4.2.2. Defining 'Harm' at the International Level: Bassiouni's Criteria for International Criminalisation . . . . .	296
4.2.3. Application . . . . .	299
4.3. Tolerance . . . . .	301
4.3.1. Content . . . . .	301
4.3.2. Application . . . . .	302
4.4. Subsidiarity . . . . .	302
4.4.1. Content . . . . .	302
4.4.2. Application . . . . .	302
4.5. Proportionality . . . . .	304
4.5.1. Content . . . . .	304
4.5.2. Application . . . . .	305
4.6. Legality . . . . .	305
4.6.1. Content . . . . .	305
4.6.2. Application . . . . .	305
4.7. Practical Applicability and Effectivity . . . . .	306
4.7.1. Content . . . . .	306
4.7.2. Application . . . . .	306
4.8. Findings . . . . .	308
5. Objectives of Punishment in International Criminal Law . . . . .	308
5.1. Introduction . . . . .	308
5.2. Retributivism . . . . .	309
5.3. Consequentialism . . . . .	310
5.3.1. Deterrence . . . . .	310
5.3.2. Incapacitation . . . . .	311
5.3.3. Rehabilitation . . . . .	311
5.4. Expressivism . . . . .	311
5.5. Other Goals . . . . .	313
5.6. Findings . . . . .	313
6. Types of Corruption Eligible for International Criminalisation <i>de lege ferenda</i> . . . . .	314
6.1. Demand-side Corruption: Tackling the Public Sector . . . . .	314
6.2. Focus on Grand Corruption . . . . .	314
6.3. Types of Corruption – UNCAC . . . . .	316
7. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	317

## Chapter VIII

### Corruption as a Crime Against Humanity under International Law

<i>de lege lata</i> ? . . . . .	319
1. Introduction . . . . .	319
2. Elements of Crimes Against Humanity: General Framework . . . . .	320
2.1. Article 7 Rome Statute . . . . .	320
2.2. <i>Actus Reus</i> . . . . .	322
2.3. <i>Mens Rea</i> . . . . .	322
2.3.1. 'Intent' . . . . .	323
2.3.2. 'Knowledge' . . . . .	325
2.4. Contextual Element: 'Widespread or Systematic Attack Directed Against Any Civilian Population' . . . . .	326
2.4.1. 'Widespread' . . . . .	326
2.4.2. 'Systematic' . . . . .	326
2.4.3. 'Attack' . . . . .	327
2.4.4. 'Directed Against Any Civilian Population' . . . . .	328
2.5. Individual Criminal Responsibility . . . . .	328
3. Corruption as 'Extermination'? . . . . .	329
3.1. Introduction . . . . .	329
3.2. Elements of Extermination . . . . .	330
3.3. Application . . . . .	331
4. Corruption as 'an Other Inhumane Act'? . . . . .	333
4.1. Introduction . . . . .	333
4.2. Elements of an Other Inhumane Act . . . . .	334
4.3. Application . . . . .	336
5. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	338

## Chapter IX

### Possibilities of Combating Corruption under International Criminal Law

<i>de lege ferenda</i> ? . . . . .	339
1. Introduction . . . . .	339
2. Possible Content of an Anti-Corruption Provision in the Rome Statute . . . . .	340
2.1. Inclusion of a Separate Anti-Corruption Provision? . . . . .	340
2.1.1. Introduction . . . . .	340
2.1.2. Passive Bribery . . . . .	341
2.1.3. Embezzlement . . . . .	344
2.2. Inclusion of New Crimes Against Humanity? . . . . .	344
3. Practical Challenges of International Prosecution Before the ICC . . . . .	345
4. Feasibility of Including an Anti-Corruption Provision into the Rome Statute . . . . .	346
5. Addressing Grand Corruption in Present Cases before the ICC . . . . .	347

6. Establishing an Anti-Corruption Tribunal: A Possible Alternative? . . . . .	348
6.1. A Permanent Anti-Corruption Court? . . . . .	348
6.2. An Ad Hoc Anti-Corruption Tribunal? . . . . .	348
7. Concluding Remarks . . . . .	349

**PART D****SUMMARY, REFLECTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS****Chapter X**

<b>Summary</b> . . . . .	353
--------------------------	-----

1. Introduction . . . . .	353
2. Part A: The Phenomenon of Corruption: An Introductory Analysis . . . . .	353
2.1. Defining and Measuring Corruption . . . . .	353
2.2. Harmful Consequences of Corruption . . . . .	354
2.3. Global and Regional Legal Framework . . . . .	355
3. Part B: Responsibility of States: Corruption as a Violation of Human Rights? . . . . .	356
3.1. Human Rights Practice . . . . .	356
3.1.1. UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies . . . . .	357
3.1.2. Universal Periodic Review . . . . .	359
3.1.3. Special Procedures of the Human Rights Council . . . . .	360
3.1.4. Regional Human Rights Mechanisms . . . . .	363
3.2. Further Links . . . . .	365
3.2.1. General Conclusions . . . . .	365
3.2.2. Merits and Limits of the Human Rights Approach to Corruption . . . . .	366
4. Part C: Individual Responsibility: Corruption as a Crime under International Law? . . . . .	367
4.1. Theoretical Considerations . . . . .	368
4.2. <i>De lege lata</i> Perspective . . . . .	370
4.2.1. Introductory Remarks . . . . .	370
4.2.2. Corruption as Extermination (Article 7(1)(b) Rome Statute)? . . . . .	371
4.2.3. Corruption as an Other Inhumane Act (Article 7(1)(k) Rome Statute)? . . . . .	372
4.3. <i>De Lege Ferenda</i> Perspective . . . . .	373

**Chapter XI**

<b>Reflections and Recommendations</b> . . . . .	375
--	-----

1. Introduction . . . . .	375
2. Corruption and International Human Rights Law . . . . .	375
2.1. Paradigm Shift: Corruption as a Violation of Human Rights . . . . .	375

2.2. Human Rights Treaty Bodies of the United Nations . . . . .	376
2.3. Universal Periodic Review of the Human Rights Council . . . . .	378
2.4. Special Procedures of the Human Rights Council . . . . .	378
2.5. Regional Human Rights Mechanisms . . . . .	379
3. Corruption and International Criminal Law . . . . .	380
4. Final Remarks . . . . .	381

<i>Samenvatting</i> . . . . .	383
<i>Annex 1. Overview of Concluding Observations on Corruption</i> . . . . .	407
<i>Annex 2. General Comment on Corruption and Human Rights: A Draft Proposal</i> . . . . .	411
<i>Bibliography</i> . . . . .	437
<i>United Nations Documents</i> . . . . .	469
<i>Table of Cases</i> . . . . .	481
<i>Index</i> . . . . .	485
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> . . . . .	489