Corruption: A Violation of Human Rights and a Crime Under International Law?

Martine Boersma

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.
Acknowledgements

our laughs accompanied by un pêlske in de kaffees vaan Mestreech were always inspiring and encouraging.

Finally, I’d like to express my utmost gratitude to my parents Eleonora and Alexander, to whom this book is dedicated. Vaanoet de grond vaan mien hart daank iech uuch veur alle steun, mét zoe vâpl dinger. Dit 'beukske' is veerdig, en iech hoop tot geer gruuts kint zien. Unne hiele groete merci!

Maastricht, July 2012

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ....................................................... vii
List of Abbreviations .................................................. xxi

General Introduction .................................................. 1

1. A Day in the Life of John and Jane Doe ................................. 1
2. Overview of Contemporary Research .................................. 2
   2.1. Corruption as a Violation of Human Rights? ................. 2
   2.2. Corruption as a Crime under International Law? ............. 7
3. Main Research Questions ............................................. 9
4. Structure ....................................................................... 9
   4.2. Part B: Responsibility of States: Corruption as a Violation of Human Rights? .................................................. 10
   4.3. Part C: Individual Responsibility: Corruption as a Crime under International Law? .................................................. 11
   4.4. Part D: Summary, Reflections and Recommendations .......... 12
5. Methodology .............................................................. 12
   5.1. Part A: The Phenomenon of Corruption: An Introductory Analysis ... 12
   5.2. Part B: Responsibility of States: Corruption as a Violation of Human Rights? .................................................. 13
      5.2.1. Data Collection and Organisation ................................. 13
      5.2.2. Interpretation of Results .............................................. 19
   5.3. Part C: Individual Responsibility: Corruption as a Crime under International Law? .................................................. 20
      5.3.1. Data Collection and Organisation ................................. 20
      5.3.2. Interpretation of Results .............................................. 21

PART A
THE PHENOMENON OF CORRUPTION: AN INTRODUCTORY ANALYSIS

Chapter I
Basic Issues .............................................................. 25

1. Introduction .................................................................. 25
2. Defining 'Corruption' ................................................... 27
   2.1. Public and Private Sector Corruption ................................ 27
   2.2. Grand and Petty Corruption ........................................ 29
### Chapter IV
Charter-Based System: Corruption as a Topic in the UPR and the Special Procedures of the UN Human Rights Council

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Universal Periodic Review</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Background</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Discussion of Corruption During the UPR Dialogue</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1. Statements by States under Review</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2. Comments and Questions by Reviewing States</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3. Recommendations Made to States under Review</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4. Countries in Respect of Which Corruption is Discussed</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5. Countries Commenting, Asking, Recommending about Corruption</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.6. The Relationship Between Corruption and Human Rights Violations</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Special Procedures of the UN Human Rights Council</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Background</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. The Former Special Rapporteur on Corruption and Its Impact on the Full Enjoyment of Human Rights, in Particular Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1. Introduction</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2. Outcomes</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3. Assessment</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Other Selected Thematic Mandates</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1. Introduction</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2. Outcomes</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3. Assessment</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter V
Regional Human Rights Practice on the Topic of Corruption

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Europe</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Background</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Practice of the European Court of Human Rights</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1. Whistleblowers’ Right to Freedom of Expression (Article 10 ECHR)</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2. Rights of Persons Accused of Corruption</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Americas</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Background</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Practice of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1. Corruption in the Judiciary</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2. Rights of Whistleblowers</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3. Economic, Social and Cultural Rights</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4. Other Issues</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Practice of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Africa</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Background</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Practice of the African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter VI
Taking It Further: Corruption as a Human Rights Violation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Clarifying the Corruption and Human Rights Connection</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Introduction</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. ICHRP’s Approach: Various Types of ‘Violations’</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Alternative Approach: ‘Dimensions’ of the Corruption and Human Rights Connection.</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Opposition to the Corruption and Human Rights Connection</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Corruption as a Violation of Civil and Political Rights</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. The Right to Equality and Non-Discrimination</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1. Introduction</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2. The Right to Equality Before the Law</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.1.3. The Right to Equal Protection of the Law .............................. 204
3.1.4. The Prohibition of Discrimination ................................. 204

3.2. The Right to Equality Before Courts and Tribunals and the Right to a Fair Trial .................................................. 205
3.2.1. Introduction ............................................................ 205
3.2.2. The Right to Equality Before Courts and Tribunals ........... 207
3.2.3. The Right to a Fair Trial ............................................. 209
3.2.4. The Presumption of Innocence .................................... 211
3.2.5. Rights of Persons Charged with a Criminal Offense .......... 211
3.2.6. The Right to a Remedy ................................................ 212

3.3. Rights of Political Participation .................................... 212
3.3.1. Introduction ............................................................ 212
3.3.2. The Right to Take Part in the Conduct of Public Affairs .... 214
3.3.3. The Right to Vote .................................................... 214
3.3.4. The Right to be Elected ............................................. 215
3.3.5. The Right of Equal Access to Public Service ................... 216

3.4. The Prohibition of Human Trafficking .............................. 216
3.4.1. Introduction ............................................................ 216
3.4.2. State Obligations under the Trafficking Protocol .......... 218
3.4.3. Article 8 ICCPR ...................................................... 218

3.5. The Rights of Detainees to be Treated with Humanity and Dignity .... 222
3.5.1. Introduction ............................................................ 222
3.5.2. Article 10 ICCPR ...................................................... 222

3.6. The Right to Freedom of Movement .................................. 224
3.6.1. Introduction ............................................................ 224
3.6.2. The Right to Liberty of Movement and Freedom to Choose Residence ................................................................. 225
3.6.3. The Freedom to Leave a Country and Liberty of Emigration 226
3.6.4. The Right to Enter One’s Own Country ............................................. 228

4. Corruption as a Violation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 228
4.1. State Party Obligations under Article 2(1) ICESCR ................. 228
4.1.1. Introduction ............................................................ 228
4.1.2. ‘Undertakes To Take Steps’ ........................................ 229
4.1.3. ‘Individually and Through International Assistance and Co-operation, Especially Economic and Technical’ .......... 230
4.1.4. ‘To the Maximum of Its Available Resources’ .................. 231
4.1.5. ‘With a View to Achieving Progressively the Full Realisation of the Rights Recognised in the Covenant’ ............ 232
4.1.6. ‘By all Appropriate Means, Including Particularly the Adoption of Legislative Measures’ ................................. 233

4.2. The Right to Food ......................................................... 234
4.2.1. Introduction ............................................................ 234
4.2.2. Content ................................................................. 235

4.2.3. State Obligations and Violations .................................. 236
4.2. The Right to Adequate Housing ........................................ 239
4.3.1. Introduction ............................................................ 239
4.3.2. Content ................................................................. 240
4.3.3. State Obligations and Violations .................................. 242

4.4. The Right to Education .................................................. 244
4.4.1. Introduction ............................................................ 244
4.4.2. Content ................................................................. 246
4.4.3. State Obligations and Violations .................................. 250

4.5. The Right to Health ....................................................... 252
4.5.1. Introduction ............................................................ 252
4.5.2. Content ................................................................. 254
4.5.3. State Obligations and Violations .................................. 258

5. Towards a New Human Right to a Corruption-Free Society? ........... 264
6.1. General Conclusions ...................................................... 267
6.2. Employing the UN Treaty Bodies ..................................... 268
6.3. The Role of the Human Rights Council: UPR and Special Procedures ...................................................... 269
6.4. Bringing Corruption Before Regional Human Rights Instances ..... 270
6.5. Domestic Human Rights Litigation .................................... 271
6.6. National Human Rights Institutions (NHRIs) ....................... 272
6.7. Cooperation between Human Rights Actors and Anti-Corruption Organisations ...................................................... 274

PART C
INDIVIDUAL RESPONSIBILITY: CORRUPTION AS A CRIME UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW?

Chapter VII
Situating Corruption Within International Criminal Law .................. 277
1. Introduction ................................................................. 277
2. Key Concepts ............................................................... 278
2.1. ICL Iargor sensus: ICL stricto sensu and Transnational Criminal Law ...................................................... 278
2.2. International Crimes: Crimes under International Law and Transnational Crimes ...................................................... 279
3. Corruption in International Criminal Law from a Historical Perspective 283
3.1. Developments until World War I ..................................... 283
3.2. Post-World War I ......................................................... 284
3.3. Post-World War II ......................................................... 285
3.4. The International Criminal Court ..................................... 287
3.4.1. Developments Leading to the ICC’s Establishment .......... 287
### Chapter VIII

#### Corruption as a Crime Against Humanity under International Law de lege lata?

1. Introduction .................................................. 319
2. Elements of Crimes Against Humanity: General Framework ........... 320
   2.1. Article 7 Rome Statute ..................................... 320
   2.2. Actus Reus .................................................. 322
   2.3. Mens Rea .................................................... 322
      2.3.1. 'Intent' ................................................. 323
      2.3.2. 'Knowledge' ......................................... 325
   2.4. Contextual Element: 'Widespread or Systematic Attack Directed
      Against Any Civilian Population' ......................... 326
      2.4.1. 'Widespread' ......................................... 326
      2.4.2. 'Systematic' ........................................... 326
      2.4.3. 'Attack' .............................................. 327
      2.4.4. 'Directed Against Any Civilian Population' ....... 328
   2.5. Individual Criminal Responsibility ........................................... 328
3. Corruption as 'Extermination'? ...................................... 329
   3.1. Introduction ............................................... 329
   3.2. Elements of Extermination .................................... 330
   3.3. Application ............................................... 331
4. Corruption as 'an Other Inhumane Act'? .............................. 333
   4.1. Introduction ............................................... 333
   4.2. Elements of an Other Inhumane Act .............................. 334
   4.3. Application ............................................... 336
5. Concluding Remarks ............................................... 338

### Chapter IX

#### Possibilities of Combating Corruption under International Criminal Law de lege ferenda?

1. Introduction .................................................. 339
2. Possible Content of an Anti-Corruption Provision in the Rome Statute .......... 340
   2.1. Inclusion of a Separate Anti-Corruption Provision? .............. 340
      2.1.1. Introduction ......................................... 340
      2.1.2. Passive Bribery ...................................... 341
      2.1.3. Embezzlement ....................................... 344
   2.2. Inclusion of New Crimes Against Humanity? ........................ 344
   3. Practical Challenges of International Prosecution Before the ICC ......... 345
4. Feasibility of Including an Anti-Corruption Provision into the Rome Statute .......... 346
5. Addressing Grand Corruption in Present Cases before the ICC .................. 347